December 18, 2019

Report update: Active duty vs. discharged veterans and international vs. domestic affiliation in the Prosecution Project (tPP) dataset
Report authored by Athena Chapekis, Director of Data Science

Prepared on request for the US Army War College c/o Col. Robert D. Payne

- For those tPP defendants coded as non-civilian, 17 were recorded as being active duty at the time of their indictment, while 102 were recorded as having been former military (87 honourably discharged, 11 dishonourably discharged, 4 hardship discharged). The remaining non-civilian defendants were listed as former or current members of a non-US military. The analysis going forward is over only the first two categories of defendants, which will be referred to as 'active duty' and 'veterans' going forward.

- The average age for active duty defendants is 28, while for veterans it is 40. This is one of the only statistically significant different found between the groups in this analysis (p < 0.001), which may be due to the limited size of the active duty group.

- All active duty defendants are male, while in the veteran group there is one female.

- Active duty defendants on average injure 5 and kill 1, while veterans on average injure 23 and kill 5, though the difference is not statistically significant.

- Active duty defendants received an average sentence length of 682 months, while veteran defendants receive an average sentence length of 189 months, though the difference is not statistically significant.

- 37.29% of active duty defendants receive life sentence (6/17), and 11.76% receive death sentences (2/17) compared to 11.76% and 3.92% respectively for veteran defendants, though the difference is not statistically significant.

- Proportionally, active duty defendants seem to prefer tactics of vehicle ramming, unarmed assault, firearms (civilian and military), CBRN, and non-politically-motivated criminal violations as tactic, though the difference is not statistically significant.

- Active duty defendants tend to target people proportionally more often, and this difference is statistically significant (p = 0.04).

- Ideologically, active duty defendants seem to be affiliated proportionally more often with unclear and 'other' ideologies, as well as having no clear ideological affiliation, though the difference is not statistically significant.

- Active duty and veteran defendants appear to be proportionally equal in whether or not their crime is given a hate crime designation.

- Active duty and veteran defendants do not appear to be proportionally different in their affiliation with Foreign Terrorist Organizations (FTO).
  - For the 16 defendants coded as active duty, 2 are noted as being affiliated with an FTO, both being the Islamic State. From the remaining 15, 9 are marked as having no group affiliation, 2 are affiliated with the Atomwaffen Division (AWD), and 4 are affiliated with the group Forever Enduring Always Ready (FEAR).
  - For the 102 defendants coded as discharged veterans, 18 are noted as being affiliated with an FTO. The organizations recorded are:
December 18, 2019

- Islamic State (ISIS/ISIL/IS), al-Qaeda, Jamaah Islamiya, Virginia Jihad Network, Abu Sayyaf Group, al-Shabaab, United Self-Defense Forces of Colombia (AUC), and Tehrik-e Taliban Pakistan.

  - Overall, of those defendants not affiliated with FTO, 46/99 have no known group affiliation. The remaining are affiliated with the domestic groups\(^1\) including:

    - Forever Enduring Always Ready (FEAR), Atomwaffen Division (AWD), various militias, Ku Klux Klan (KKK), Phineas Priesthood, Aryan Nation (AN), Army of God (AOG), National Alliance (NA), and New World Order (NWO).

**Defendants who were active duty at time of prosecution**

- Hasan K. Akbar
- Noureddine Malki
- Kody Ray Brittingham
- Naser Jason Abu
- Anthony Peden
- Christopher Salmon
- Isaac Aguigui
- Michael Burnett
- Hasan Rasheed Edmons
- Brandon Clint Russell
- Ikaika Erik Kang
- James Alex Fields Jr. (state case)
- James Alex Fields Jr. (federal case)
- Nidal Malik Hasan
- Dylan Millhausen
- Christopher Paul Hasson
- Jarrett William Smith

\(^1\) At least one defendant’s affiliation is listed as the Azov Battalion, a far-right Ukrainian regiment of the Ukrainian National Guard. Although the Azov Battalion is not listed by the Department of State as a FTO, it is indeed a foreign organization.
December 18, 2019

Veteran versus civilian comparisons in the Prosecution Project (tPP) dataset
Report authored by Athena Chapekis, Director of Data Science, and Katie Blowers, Director of Records, the Prosecution Project

Prepared on request for the US Army War College c/o Col. Robert D. Payne

I. Describing the data
From 2395 cases in the Prosecution Project dataset (as of 12/4/2019; including pending outcome cases), 140 individuals are marked as being either active duty or veterans, while 2255 individuals are marked as civilian. Going forward, these two categories will be referred to as ‘veterans’ and ‘civilians.’ Eleven cases were excluded from this analysis due to the variable Veteran status being coded as ‘Unknown.’ It is acknowledged that some individuals marked ‘Civilian’ may in fact be veterans, but if their veteran status was never mentioned in news coverage or formal legal proceedings, this information will be missing from the Prosecution Project data.

II. Analysis: averages, ratios, and T-tests
The average age for veterans is 38 years old, while the average age for civilians is 36. According to an independent samples T-test, this difference is significant (p < 0.05), with 95% confidence that the true mean age of veterans is anywhere from 0.4 to 5 years greater than the average age of civilians.

The male-to-female gender ratio for veterans is 139:1, while for civilians it is 9:1. This difference is also significant (p < 0.001).

On average, crimes by veterans injure 53 people and kill 8. Civilian crimes, on average, injure 55 and kill 4. The differences in both the number injured and the number killed are not statistically significant.

The average sentence length for veterans is 220 months, while for civilians it is 126 months. This difference is not statistically significant. Approximately 16% of veterans receive one or more life sentences, while only about 5% of civilians do – this difference is significant (p = 0.001). In terms of death sentences, around 3.6% of veterans receive a death sentence, while less than 1% of civilians receive a death sentence, though the difference here is not statistically significant.

III. Analysis: distributions, proportions, and Chi-squared
Proportionally, just under 9% of the cases coded for Veteran status are marked as veterans. The analysis going forward is based off of this proportion.

A Chi-squared test of independence indicates that tactic used is not independent of veteran status (p < 0.001). A proportional bar chart reveals that veterans tend to use CBRN weapons, vehicle ramming, firearms (both civilian and military), explosives, blockading, armed intimidation, and various or ‘other’ methods as tactics in their crimes more often, while tending to use other tactics including hostage-taking, arson, and animal release less often than civilians.

The targeting of people versus property also is not independent of veteran status (p < 0.001). Veterans tend to target people more often than civilians, as well as having unspecified, unknown, or undeveloped targets more often. Civilians tend to be prosecuted for crimes with no direct target – that is, crimes which did not specifically have a physical target of people or property – more often.

Ideologically affiliation is also indicated to be not independent of veteran status (p < 0.001). Veterans tend to be ideologically affiliated as Rightist: government-focused, Rightist: unspecified, and ‘other’ at far higher proportions than civilians. Veterans appear to affiliate with leftist ideologies proportionally.
December 18, 2019

far less often than civilians. Veterans also appear to be prosecuted for crimes with no ideological affiliation/in which ideology is not a factor less often than civilians.

According to Chi-squared tests being prosecuted with a hate crime designation is independent of veteran status; however, veterans appear to affiliate with foreign terrorist organizations (FTOs) proportionally less often (p < 0.05).

IV. Analysis: regression
Basic multiple linear regression was performed on the data based on the variables previously analyzed to check for significant predictors.

A best-fit model, fit to predict sentence length (in months) using backward stepwise selection found that Veteran status is a significant predictor of sentence length, holding all other variables constant. Other significant predictors include:

• number killed,
• number injured,
• targets people and people and property,
• ideologies Leftist: identity focused, Rightist: unspecified, and Jihadist,
• combat veteran status, and
• citizenship statuses refugee and permanent resident.

However, this model is not statistically very reliable – only about 16% of the variation in the data is explained by this model. The predictors listed do have a significant impact on sentencing length, but there are other factors that are not contained in this model that also can be expected to impact sentencing length.

A model fit to specifically predict sentence length (in months) for veterans selected using backward stepwise selection has a somewhat better fit – approximately 53% of the variation in the data is explained by the model – but should still not be taken as explanation on its own.

In the regression model for veterans, significant predictors are:

• tactic criminal violation not linked or motivated politically;
• number killed; and
• number injured.
## V. Appendix: veteran case list

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993-08-24</td>
<td>Earl Gant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993-12-02</td>
<td>Buford O’Neal Furrow Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-07-19</td>
<td>Milan S. Mietich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-07-28</td>
<td>Donald Beauregard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-11-15</td>
<td>Eric Robert Rudolph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-01-24</td>
<td>Mourad Topalian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-01-31</td>
<td>Abdel Basset Ali Al-Megrahi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-06-21</td>
<td>Hussein Al-Mughis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-06-28</td>
<td>Dennis John Malvasi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-05-08</td>
<td>Jose Padilla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-05-08</td>
<td>Kifah Jayyousi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-10-03</td>
<td>Jeffrey Leon Battle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-10-03</td>
<td>Larry Raugust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-03-17</td>
<td>Dwight Watson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-03-25</td>
<td>Hasan K. Akbar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-06-27</td>
<td>Donald Thomas Surrrt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-06-27</td>
<td>Hammad Abdur-Raheem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-06-27</td>
<td>Seifullah Chapman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-02-12</td>
<td>Ryan G. Anderson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-04-16</td>
<td>Sean Michael Gillespie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-06-15</td>
<td>Tomer Grinberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-06-16</td>
<td>Anthonius Wamang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-08-27</td>
<td>Lamont Ranson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-10-13</td>
<td>Ivan Duane Braden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-11-07</td>
<td>Noureddine Malik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-03-18</td>
<td>Hassan Abujihaad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-04-11</td>
<td>Christopher Paul</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2007-04-26 | James Ray McElroy           |
2007-04-26 | Randall Garrett Cole        |
2007-07-05 | Christopher Rienandeau      |
2008-04-24 | Viktor Bout                 |
2008-07-08 | Bradley T. Kahle            |
2008-07-27 | Jim Adkisson                |
2008-11-01 | Bryant Neal Vinas           |
2008-12-12 | Joshua Turmidge             |
2008-12-15 | Kody Ray Brittingham        |
2009-04-02 | Robert Bayliss              |
2009-04-04 | Richard Popolyawski         |
2011-01-18 | Kevin William Harpham       |
2011-01-24 | Roger Stockham              |
2011-04-01 | Robert Olson                |
2011-06-21 | Yonathan Melaku             |
2011-07-21 | Naser Jason Abu             |
2011-12-10 | Anthony Peden               |
2011-12-10 | Christopher Salmon          |
2011-12-10 | Heather Salmon              |
2011-12-10 | Isaac Aguigui               |
2011-12-10 | Michael Burnett             |
2012-03-07 | Craig Benedict Baxam        |
2012-05-23 | Andrew Smulian              |
2012-05-24 | Mauricio Santoy Velasco     |
2012-11-20 | Miguel Alejandro Santina Vidriales |
2013-03-07 | Matthew Aaron Llanza        |
2013-06-19 | Eric Harroun                |
2013-08-06 | Jedediah Stout              |
2013-09-19 | Matthew Fairfield            |
2013-12-13 | Keith Michael Novak        |
2013-12-30 | Justin Shawn Baker          |
2014-10-08 | Irek Ilgiz Hamidullin       |
2014-10-14 | Ahmed Salim Faraj Abu Khatallah |
2015-03-25 | Hasan Rasheed Edmonds       |
2015-05-13 | Bilal Abood                 |
2015-08-01 | Walter Eugene Litteral      |
2015-11-10 | Frazier Glenn Miller        |
2016-01-02 | Duane Leo Ehmer             |
2016-01-02 | Jon Eric Ritzheimer         |
2016-03-08 | Ryan Waylen Payne (1)*      |
2016-03-02 | Gerald A. DeLemus           |
2016-03-02 | Ryan Waylen Payne (2)        |
2016-07-07 | Lakeem Keon Scott           |
2016-07-22 | Gregory Hubbard             |
2016-10-14 | Curtis Wayne Allen          |
2016-10-14 | Gavin Wayne Wright          |
2016-10-27 | Michael Markus              |
2017-01-26 | Esteban Santiago-Ruiu       |
2017-02-03 | Joshua Cummings             |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017-03-01</td>
<td>Michael Mateo Markus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-03-26</td>
<td>Joseph Giaquinto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-03-27</td>
<td>James Harris Jackson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-05-05</td>
<td>Clark Calloway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-05-31</td>
<td>Tairod Nathan Webster Pugh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-06-07</td>
<td>Brandon Clint Russell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-06-22</td>
<td>Marq Vincent Perez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-07-10</td>
<td>Ikaika Erik Kang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-08-12</td>
<td>Vasiliios Pistolis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-08-18</td>
<td>James Alex Fields Jr. (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-01-04</td>
<td>Everitt Aaron Jameson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-03-09</td>
<td>Chad Horsley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-06-27</td>
<td>James Alex Fields Jr. (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-08-31</td>
<td>Dylan Millhausen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-05-30</td>
<td>Douglas Howard Story</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2016-03-02</td>
<td>Joseph Donald O’Shaughnessy (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-02-19</td>
<td>Robert Lorenzo Hester Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-03-17</td>
<td>John Rayne Rivello</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-06-15</td>
<td>Matthew P. Wright</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-10-18</td>
<td>William Clyde Allen III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-12-11</td>
<td>Travis David Condor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-01-29</td>
<td>James Timpanaro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-02-27</td>
<td>Christopher Paul Hasson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-04-04</td>
<td>William John Shutt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-04-26</td>
<td>Isaiah Joel Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-05-22</td>
<td>Mark Steven Domingo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-05-22</td>
<td>Kyle Kowalski</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-08-19</td>
<td>Arnold D. Holmes Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-09-25</td>
<td>Jarrett William Smith</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* markers (1) and (2) are used for individuals who appear in the data multiple times for different charges
VI. Appendix: visualizations

Target Distribution

- Unspecified/unknown/undescribed
- Property
- People and property
- People
- No direct target

Proportion

Ideological Affiliation Distribution

- Unclear
- Satrifi/Jehadist/Islamist
- Rightist: unspecified
- Rightist: identity-focused
- Rightist: government-focused
- Rightist: abortion-focused
- Other
- No affiliation/not a factor
- Nationalist-separatist
- Leftist: unspecified
- Leftist: identity-focused
- Leftist: government-focused
- Leftist: eco-animal focused

Proportion